

JUN 24 2008

STATE OF ARIZONA

DEPT OF INSURANCE

ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE

BY



In the Matter of:

Docket No. 08A-111-INS

HUMANA INSURANCE COMPANY

NAIC #73288

CONSENT ORDER

Respondent.

On August 8, 2007 the Arizona Department of Insurance ('Department') called a healthcare insurance compliance examination ('Examination') of Humana Insurance Company ('HIC' or the 'Company') covering the time period from January 1, 2006 through December 6, 2007 ('Examination Period'). The Examination Period was divided into four six-month periods ('Partial Examination Periods' or 'PEPs') as follows:

PEP 1: January 1, 2006 – June 30, 2006

PEP 2: July 1, 2006 – December 31, 2006

PEP 3: January 1, 2007 – June 30, 2007

PEP 4: July 1, 2007 – December 6, 2007

The Report of the Health Insurance Compliance Examination of Humana Insurance Company dated March 3, 2008 ('Report'), which is included herein by reference, alleges that Humana Insurance Company violated Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) §§ 20-2533 through 20-2537. Humana Insurance Company wishes to resolve this matter without formal proceedings. HIC admits the following Findings of Fact are true and consents to the entry of the following Conclusions of Law solely for the purpose of resolving the allegations contained in the Report and consents to the entry of the following Order.

1
2 **FINDINGS OF FACT**
3

4 I. Jurisdiction.

5 Humana Insurance Company is, and throughout the Examination Period was,
6 authorized to operate as a disability insurer pursuant to a Certificate of
7 Authority issued by the Arizona Insurance Director ('Director').

8 II. Utilization Review and Health Care Appeals.

- 9 A. During the Examination Period, in 29 of 71 (41% of) appeals, Humana
10 Insurance Company failed to provide a health care appeals information
11 packet to the member within five business days after the date the appeal
12 was initiated.
- 13 B. During the Examination Period, in 29 of 71 (41% of) appeals, Humana
14 Insurance Company failed to notify the member of the right to appeal or
15 failed to issue an explanation of benefits document that provided the
16 member the correct timeframe to file an appeal.
- 17 C. During the Examination Period, Humana Insurance Company's initial
18 determination letter appeared to provide the company discretion in
19 deciding if an appeal that was certified by a provider would be heard as an
20 expedited appeal.
- 21 D. During PEPs 2 and 4, in 2 of 2 (100% of) requests for expedited medical
22 review, Humana Insurance Company failed to inform the member and the
23 member's treating provider of the expedited decision within one business
24 day.
25

- 1 E. During PEPs 2, 3 and 4, in 5 of 5 (100% of) requests for an expedited
2 medical review where there was an adverse decision, Humana Insurance
3 Company failed to notify the member or the member's treating provider by
4 telephone and mail of the adverse decision or of the member's option to
5 immediately proceed to an expedited appeal.
- 6 F. During PEPs 2, 3 and 4, in 8 of 14 (57% of) requests for informal
7 reconsideration, Humana Insurance Company failed to mail a written
8 acknowledgment to the member within five business days after receipt of
9 the request, or failed to mail a written acknowledgment to the member's
10 treating provider within five business days after receipt of the request or
11 failed to do either.
- 12 G. During PEP 3, in 1 of 5 (20% of) informal reconsiderations, Humana
13 Insurance Company failed, when a service or claim was denied at the
14 conclusion of the informal reconsideration, to provide the member and the
15 treating provider with a written statement of the agent's decision and the
16 criteria used and clinical reasons for that decision and the option to
17 proceed after the formal appeal process to an external independent review.
- 18 H. During the Examination Period, in 19 of 46 (41% of) formal appeals,
19 Humana Insurance Company failed to mail a written acknowledgment to
20 the member and the member's treating provider within five business days
21 after receipt of the formal appeal.
- 22 I. During PEP 2, in 1 of 2 (50% of) formal appeals, where the issue was of
23 medical necessity under the coverage document and not whether the
24 service is covered, Humana Insurance Company failed to have a utilization
25 review agent who is qualified in a similar scope of practice render a

1 decision based on the utilization review plan adopted by the utilization
2 review agent.

3 J. During the Examination Period, in 9 of 22 (41% of) formal appeals, when at
4 the conclusion of the formal appeal process the utilization review agent
5 denies the appeal, Humana Insurance Company failed to notify the
6 member with notice of the option to proceed to an external independent
7 review.

8 K. During PEP 2, in 1 of 1 (100% of) external independent reviews, Humana
9 Insurance Company failed to forward to the director the request for review,
10 the terms of agreement in the member's policy, evidence of coverage or a
11 similar document and all medical records and supporting documents.

12 L. During PEP 3, in 1 of 1 (100% of), when handling requests for expedited
13 external independent reviews, Humana Insurance Company failed to mail a
14 written acknowledgment to the director, the member, the member's treating
15 provider and the health care insurer within one business day.

1
2 **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**
3

4 I. Jurisdiction.

5 The Director has the authority to enter and enforce this Order. A.R.S. § 20-
6 142.

7 II. Utilization Review and Health Care Appeals.

8 A. During the Examination Period, Humana Insurance Company violated
9 A.R.S. § 20-2533(C) by failing to provide a health care appeals information
10 packet to the member within five business days after the date the appeal
11 was initiated.

12 B. During the Examination Period, Humana Insurance Company violated
13 A.R.S. § 20-2533(D) by failing to notify the member of the right to appeal or
14 failing to issue an explanation of benefits document that provided the
15 member the correct timeframe to file an appeal.

16 C. During the Examination Period, Humana Insurance Company violated
17 A.R.S. § 20-2534(A) by an initial determination letter that appeared to
18 provide the company discretion in deciding if an appeal that was certified
19 by a provider would be heard as an expedited appeal.

20 D. During PEPs 2 and 4, Humana Insurance Company violated A.R.S. § 20-
21 2534(B) by failing, in requests for expedited medical review, to inform the
22 member and the member's treating provider of the expedited decision
23 within one business day.
24
25

- 1 E. During PEPs 2, 3 and 4, Humana Insurance Company violated A.R.S. §
2 20-2534(C) by failing, in requests for an expedited medical review where
3 there was an adverse decision, to notify the member or the member's
4 treating provider by telephone and mail of the adverse decision or of the
5 member's option to immediately proceed to an expedited appeal.
- 6 F. During PEPs 2, 3 and 4, Humana Insurance Company violated A.R.S. §
7 20-2535(B) by failing, in requests for informal reconsideration, to mail a
8 written acknowledgment to the member within five business days after
9 receipt of the request, or failing to mail a written acknowledgment to the
10 member's treating provider within five business days after receipt of the
11 request or failing to do either.
- 12 G. During PEP 3, Humana Insurance Company violated A.R.S. § 20-2535(F)
13 by failing, in informal reconsiderations when a service or claim was denied
14 at the conclusion of the informal reconsideration, to provide the member
15 and the treating provider with a written statement of the agent's decision
16 and the criteria used and clinical reasons for that decision and the option to
17 proceed after the formal appeal process to an external independent review.
- 18 H. During the Examination Period, Humana Insurance Company violated
19 A.R.S. § 20-2536(B) by failing, in formal appeals, to mail a written
20 acknowledgment to the member and the member's treating provider within
21 five business days after receipt of the formal appeal.
- 22 I. During PEP 2, Humana Insurance Company violated A.R.S. § 20-2536(D)
23 by failing, in formal appeals where the issue was of medical necessity
24 under the coverage document and not whether the service is covered, to
25 have a utilization review agent who is qualified in a similar scope of

1 practice render a decision based on the utilization review plan adopted by
2 the utilization review agent.

3 J. During the Examination Period, Humana Insurance Company violated
4 A.R.S. § 20-2536(G) by failing, in formal appeals when at the conclusion of
5 the formal appeal process the utilization review agent denies the appeal, to
6 notify the member with notice of the option to proceed to an external
7 independent review.

8 K. During PEP 2, Humana Insurance Company violated A.R.S. § 20-
9 2537(C)(2) by failing, in external independent reviews, to forward to the
10 director the request for review, the terms of agreement in the member's
11 policy, evidence of coverage or a similar document and all medical records
12 and supporting documents.

13 L. During PEP 3, Humana Insurance Company violated A.R.S. § 20-
14 2537(K)(2)(a) by failing, when handling requests for expedited external
15 independent reviews, to mail a written acknowledgment to the director, the
16 member, the member's treating provider and the health care insurer within
17 one business day.

1
2 **ORDER**

3 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:**

- 4 1. Utilization Review and Health Care Appeals. Within 90 days of the filed date of this
5 Order, Humana Insurance Company shall submit to the Arizona Department of
6 Insurance for the Director's approval a Corrective Action Plan (CAP) regarding its
7 utilization review and health care appeals violations set forth in this Consent Order.
8 The CAP shall provide specific steps Humana Insurance Company has taken or
9 will take by certain dates to assure that by a specified implementation date,
10 Humana Insurance Company is:
- 11 a. Providing a health care appeals information packet to the member within
12 five business days after the date the appeal was initiated.
 - 13 b. Notifying the member of the right to appeal or issuing an explanation of
14 benefits document that provides the member the correct timeframe to file an
15 appeal.
 - 16 c. Sending an initial determination letter that does not appear to provide the
17 company discretion to decide if an appeal that was certified by a provider
18 would be heard as an expedited appeal.
 - 19 d. In requests for expedited medical review, notifying the member and the
20 member's treating provider of the expedited decision within one business
21 day.
 - 22 e. In requests for expedited medical review where there was an adverse
23 decision, notifying the member or the member's treating provider by
24 telephone and mail of the adverse decision and of the member's option to
25 immediately proceed to an expedited appeal.

- 1 f. In requests for informal reconsideration, mailing a written acknowledgment
2 to the member within five business days after receipt of the request, or
3 mailing a written acknowledgment to the member's treating provider within
4 five business days after receipt of the request or not failing to do either.
- 5 g. In informal reconsiderations, when a service or claim was denied at the
6 conclusion of the informal reconsideration, providing the member and the
7 treating provider with a written statement of the agent's decision and the
8 criteria used and clinical reasons for that decision and the option to proceed
9 after the formal appeal process to an external independent review.
- 10 h. In formal appeals, mailing a written acknowledgment to the member and the
11 member's treating provider within five business days after receipt of the
12 formal appeal.
- 13 i. In formal appeals, where the issue was of medical necessity under the
14 coverage document and not whether the service is covered, having a
15 utilization review agent who is qualified in a similar scope of practice render
16 a decision based on the utilization review plan adopted by the utilization
17 review agent.
- 18 j. In formal appeals, when at the conclusion of the formal appeal process the
19 utilization review agent denies the appeal, notifying the member with notice
20 of the option to proceed to an external independent review.
- 21 k. In external independent reviews, forwarding to the director the request for
22 review the terms of agreement in the member's policy, evidence of
23 coverage or a similar document and all medical records and supporting
24 documents.
25

1 I. When handling requests for expedited external independent reviews,
2 mailing a written acknowledgment to the director, the member, the
3 member's treating provider and the health care insurer within one business
4 day.

5 2. Progress in Development of the CAP. Until the Director approves the CAP,
6 Humana Insurance Company shall report to the Director each month on its
7 progress in the development of the CAP. Each such monthly report shall include a
8 current draft of the CAP. The first monthly CAP development report is due to the
9 Director 30 days from the date of this Order.

10 3. Corrective Action Plan Requirements. The CAP described above shall:

11 a. Specify any CAP items ('a' through 'l') that the Director has in writing either
12 approved as ready for implementation or accepted as implemented before
13 the date of the report and for each one include:

- 14 i. documentation of the implementation or progress toward
- 15 implementation, as applicable,
- 16 ii. post implementation Quality Improvement review and follow-
- 17 up, and
- 18 iii. the name and contact information for one individual
- 19 responsible for ongoing implementation of the item.

20 b. Specify the CAP items ('a' through 'l') that the Director has not approved as
21 ready for implementation or accepted as implemented as of the date of the
22 report and for each one include:

- 23 i. enough detail to allow the Director to determine whether the
- 24 CAP will accomplish its purpose,
- 25 ii. testing before final implementation of the CAP,

- 1 iii. post implementation Quality Improvement review and follow-up,
2 and
3 iv. the name and contact information for one individual responsible
4 and accountable for ongoing implementation of the item.
- 5 c. Provide for Humana Insurance Company to report to the Director each
6 month regarding implementation of each approved item of the CAP, in a
7 form that includes documentation and is approved by the Director. If any
8 item of the CAP has been implemented, provide documentation that
9 demonstrates the results of the changes. If any item of the CAP is in the
10 process of implementation, provide documentation that demonstrates the
11 progress that has been made
- 12 d. Provide that within 10 business days of receipt of notice that the Director
13 has approved any item of the CAP, Humana Insurance Company shall
14 submit to the Director evidence that Humana Insurance Company has
15 communicated any item of the CAP to the appropriate personnel and begun
16 implementation. Evidence of communication and implementation includes,
17 without limitation, memos, bulletins, e-mails, correspondence, procedure
18 manuals, print screens and training materials.
- 19 4. Civil Penalty. Humana Insurance Company shall pay a civil penalty of \$23,625.00
20 to the Director for deposit in the State General Fund for violations cited above as
21 Conclusions of Law. Humana Insurance Company shall remit this civil penalty to
22 the Life & Health Division of the Department prior to the Department filing of this
23 Order.
- 24
25

1 The Department will file the Report of the Health Insurance Compliance Examination
2 of Humana Insurance Company upon the filing of this order.

3
4 DATED at Phoenix, Arizona this 20th day of June, 2008.

5
6 

7 Christina Urias
8 Director of Insurance
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2 **CONSENT TO ORDER**
3

4 1. Humana Insurance Company has reviewed the foregoing Order and
5 carefully considered it in conjunction with its other business and regulatory
6 requirements. Humana Insurance Company believes that it is able and prepared to
7 comply fully with the order, notwithstanding any of its other business and regulatory
8 requirements.

9 2. Humana Insurance Company admits the jurisdiction of the Director of
10 Insurance, State of Arizona, admits the Findings of Fact and consents to the entry of
11 the Conclusions of Law solely for the purposes of resolving the allegations contained
12 in the Report and consents to entry of the Order.

13 3. Humana Insurance Company is aware of the right to a hearing, at which
14 it may be represented by counsel, present evidence and cross-examine witnesses.
15 Humana Insurance Company irrevocably waives the right to such notice and hearing
16 and to any court appeals related to this Order.

17 4. Humana Insurance Company states that no promise of any kind or
18 nature whatsoever was made to it to induce it to enter into this Consent Order and that
19 it has entered into this Consent Order voluntarily.


20 5. Humana Insurance Company acknowledges that the acceptance of this
21 Order by the Director of the Arizona Department of Insurance is solely for the purpose
22 of settling this matter. This Order does not preclude any other agency or officer of this
23 state or its subdivisions or any other person from instituting proceedings, whether civil,
24 criminal, or administrative, as may be appropriate now or in the future and does not
25

1 preclude the Department from instituting proceedings as may be appropriate on other
2 matters now or in the future.

3 6. Michael B. McCallister, who holds the office of President and Chief
4 Executive Officer, is authorized to enter into this Order for Humana Insurance
5 Company and on its behalf.

6
7 **Humana Insurance Company**

8
9 June 11, 2008
Date

By 
Michael B. McCallister
President and Chief Executive Officer
Humana Insurance Company

1 **COPY of the foregoing mailed/delivered**
2 **this 24th day of Jun, 2008, to:**

3 Gerrie Marks
4 Deputy Director
5 Mary Butterfield
6 Assistant Director
7 Consumer Affairs Division
8 Paul J. Hogan
9 Market Oversight Division Chief
10 Dean Ehler
11 Assistant Director
12 Rates & Regulations Division
13 Steve Ferguson
14 Assistant Director
15 Financial Affairs Division
16 David Lee
17 Chief Financial Examiner
18 Alexandra Shafer
19 Assistant Director
20 Life and Health Division
21 Terry L. Cooper
22 Fraud Unit Chief
23
24
25

15 ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF INSURANCE
16 2910 North 44th Street, Suite 210
17 Phoenix, AZ 85018

18 Humana Insurance Company
19 Michael B. McCallister,
20 President and Chief Executive Officer
21 500 West Main Street
22 Louisville, KY 40202
23
24
25

21 
22
23
24
25